Report

Board of Deputies of British Jews 1 Torriano Mews London, NW5 2RZ United Kingdom

Report of: Professor Ghil'ad Zuckermann

Address: School of Humanities, Faculty of Arts, The University of Adelaide, South

Australia 5005, Australia

Occupation: Chair of Linguistics and Endangered Languages

Date: 27 December 2021

I, **Ghil'ad Zuckermann** of the School of Humanities, Faculty of Arts, The University of Adelaide in the State of South Australia, Australia; Chair of Linguistics and Endangered Languages; affirm:

1. The facts stated in this report are based on my own personal knowledge and enquiries that I have made, as set out in this report. The opinions that I set out in this report are based on my knowledge and experience referred to in Section B below.

A. BACKGROUND

- I am a Professor of Linguistics and the Chair of Linguistics and Endangered Languages at the University of Adelaide. I have 25 years' experience in several fields of linguistic research, including forensic linguistics, phonetics, lexicology, lexicography, dialectology, lexical borrowing, contact linguistics and revivalistics (language revival).
- 3. I have been engaged by the Board of Deputies of British Jews to give independent expert advice. I am not aware of any conflict of interest or any other reason that may prevent me from acting as an independent expert witness in this case.
- 4. I have set out in the body of this report my answers to each of the four questions I was asked by the Board of Deputies of British Jews.
- 5. In the preparation of this report, I have had no discussions with any person involved in the incident described by the Board of Deputies of British Jews. I have

no idea who these people are and all my observations are based entirely on the original footage I was provided with.

B. QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE

- 6. Located at **Annexure GZ-1** is a copy of my curriculum vitae, which summarizes my academic and professional experience. The curriculum vitae includes, *inter alia*, a list of my qualifications, teaching experience, research fellowships, research grants, professional memberships, academic publications and a selection of keynote conference papers.
- 7. I describe in this report the training, study and experience through which I have acquired specialized knowledge in the field of linguistics. Besides the information included in **Annexure GZ-1**, I set out a description of my relevant training, study and experience in the field of linguistics in paragraphs 8 to 30 below.

B1. Qualifications

- 8. I hold a Doctor of Philosophy (D.Phil.) in modern languages and linguistics from the University of Oxford, as well as a Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) (incorporated) in linguistics from the University of Cambridge. Located at **Annexure GZ-2** is a copy of a certification of my D.Phil. from the University of Oxford. Located at **Annexure GZ-3** is a copy of a certification of my Ph.D. (incorporated) from the University of Cambridge. I also hold a Master of Arts (*summa cum laude*) in linguistics from Tel Aviv University (Adi Lautman Interdisciplinary Programme for Outstanding Students).
- 9. I am fluent in 13 languages, and most importantly for this specific report, am a native speaker of Israeli (the language resulting from the Hebrew revival, a.k.a. Modern Hebrew), as well as semi-native of English. (I shall explain the difference between Israeli and Hebrew in Section D1 below.)

B2. Teaching Experience

10. Since February 2011, I have been a tenured Full Professor (the highest academic rank) of Linguistics and Chair of Linguistics and Endangered Languages at the Department of Linguistics, School of Humanities, Faculty of Arts, University of Adelaide in South Australia, Australia. In my role as a Professor of Linguistics, I

am the convener of various linguistics courses, including *Phonetics* and *Lexicology*.

- 11. In my role as the Chair of Linguistics and Endangered Languages I have supervised 10 postdoctoral fellows, 13 Ph.D. students, and dozens of Master by Research candidates in their exploration of a range of phonetic and lexicological subjects, including research topics that require a detailed analysis of corpora in a variety of languages, such as English, Israeli, Hebrew, Mandarin Chinese, Arabic, Yiddish, Indonesian and various indigenous languages.
- 12. Between 2006 and 2011, I was Associate Professor of Linguistics at the University of Queensland. I was the convener of courses that taught students about phonetics, lexicology and revivalistics. I was also the convener of a linguistic research writing group that taught students about methods of linguistic research and problem solving.
- 13. I have been a Distinguished Visiting Professor of Linguistics at universities on four continents. I have taught courses at the following universities:
 - (a) Middlebury College (2019, 2021) (teaching Ph.D. students who specialize in Israeli and Hebrew language teaching);
 - (b) Shanghai Jiao Tong University (2014-2018);
 - (c) East China Normal University (2014-2015);
 - (d) Shanghai International Studies University (2010-2016);
 - (e) Hebrew University of Jerusalem (2010-2015);
 - (f) Pavol Jozef Šafárik University (2010);
 - (g) University of Haifa (2003-2006);
 - (h) Ben-Gurion University of the Negev (2003-2004);
 - (i) University of Miami (2003-2004);
 - (j) University of Cambridge (2002-2003); and

(k) National University of Singapore (2001-2002).

B3. Research Positions

- 14. I have also been a research fellow at the following institutions, conducting research on lexicographic and lexicological issues, including:
 - (a) Weizmann Institute of Science (2012-2019);
 - (b) Shanghai International Studies University (2010-2016);
 - (c) Mahidol University (2018-2019);
 - (d) Tel Aviv University (2013-2014);
 - (e) Israel Institute for Advanced Studies, Hebrew University of Jerusalem (2012-2013);
 - (f) La Trobe University (2004-2006);
 - (g) Churchill College, University of Cambridge (2000-2004);
 - (h) Bellagio Study and Conference Centre (Rockefeller Foundation) (Summer 2003);
 - (i) University of Texas at Austin (Winter 2001); and
 - (j) National Language Research Institute in Tokyo (Summer 1999).

B4. Professional Memberships

- 15. I am a member of a number of national and international professional bodies relating to linguistic and lexicological study and research.
- 16. In July 2013 I was elected President of the Australasian Association of Lexicography (AUSTRALEX) and held that position until the end of the term, in November 2015. AUSTRALEX is the peak professional lexicographic organization for lexicographers and individuals interested in the study of lexicography in Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific. Founded in 1990, AUSTRALEX is a member of the Global Association of Lexicography (GLOBALEX), which is the

emerging umbrella organization for each of the peak lexicographic bodies around the world. I am a founding member of GLOBALEX and have contributed to its establishment.

- 17. I have been the keynote/invited speaker at the AUSTRALEX conference 4 times and addressed AUSTRALEX members on the following topics:
 - (a) Cook Islands (2017): Intersections between oral narratives, traditions, lexicography and the New Media.
 - (b) Auckland (2015): Dictionaries and revivalistics, including a discussion of the use of lexicographic techniques to create an online dictionary for a sleeping beauty language.
 - (c) Brisbane (2006): Loanwords, including a discussion of how to use corpora to predict the lexicographic acceptability of a neologism on the basis of the neologizational mechanism employed (e.g. phono-semantic matching).
 - (d) Melbourne (2005): Language academies, including a discussion of language planning, policy, purism and prescriptivism in multiple languages.
- 18. I am also a member of the following professional bodies that lead linguistic and phonetic research around the world:
 - (a) Linguistic Society of America (USA);
 - (b) The Philological Society (UK);
 - (c) The European Association of Lexicography (Europe);
 - (d) Cambridge Institute of Language Research (UK);
 - (e) Centre for Research on Language Change (Australia);
 - (f) Australian Linguistic Society (Australia);
 - (g) Australian Association for Jewish Studies (President, 2017-present); and
 - (h) Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies (Australia).

B5. Consultancies

- 19. Since 1998, I have been a consultant for the Oxford English Dictionary (OED) (Oxford University Press, OUP). As a consultant, I am called upon by the Oxford English Dictionary to provide input on various issues from time to time. The issues that I am asked to consult upon range from Hebrew etymology (word derivation) to the analysis of the frequency and usage of words to determine whether or not they should be included in the Oxford English Dictionary.
- 20. Since 2002, I have also been a consultant for the Oxford University Press and have been engaged from time to time to review and assess dictionaries and linguistic books. For example, in or around 2003 I was contracted to evaluate critically and report on the lexicographic calibre of the Oxford Pocket Dictionary English-Hebrew / Hebrew-English.
- 21. In addition, I have been a consultant for a number of other international publishing houses assessing linguistic, phonetic and lexicological books. Those publishing houses include Yale University Press (since 2007) and Cambridge University Press (since 2009).

B6. Publications

- 22. I am the author of more than 150 refereed scholarly publications on various fields of linguistic research. I set out a detailed list of those publications on pages 26 to 43 of my curriculum vitae at **Annexure GZ-1**.
- 23. My 2020 book *Revivalistics: From the Genesis of Israeli to Language Reclamation in Australia and Beyond* (New York: Oxford University Press) was listed as No. 7 in *The Australian* newspaper 'Australia's top 10 academic books' for the year 2021 see p. 50 of The Australian's 'Research Magazine 2021', 10 November 2021.
- 24. My recent book, 多源造词研究 (A Study of Multisourced Neologization), which focuses on Israeli, was published, in Modern Standard Chinese, by East China Normal University Press in 2021 (430 pages, ISBN 9787567598935).

- 25. Since 2004, I have been a founding editorial board member of the *Journal of Language Contact*, which is the world's leading journal for the analysis of cultural interaction as reflected in words and languages.
- 26. I have been a referee of numerous scholarly articles that have been submitted for publication *inter alia* in the following:
 - (a) International Journal of Lexicography;
 - (b) Encyclopaedia of Applied Linguistics (including lexicography);
 - (c) Journal of Languages in Contrast;
 - (d) Australian Journal of Linguistics;
 - (e) Proceedings of the Australian Linguistic Society;
 - (f) AlterNative: An International Journal of Indigenous Peoples;
 - (g) Balshanut Ivrit (Hebrew Linguistics); and
 - (h) Journal of Modern Jewish Studies.
- 27. I am the author of three volumes involving phonetics and lexicology of the Barngarla Aboriginal language of South Australia:
 - (a) First Online Dictionary of the Barngarla Language (https://www.barngarla.com/dictionary);
 - (b) Barngarlidhi Manoo (Speaking Barngarla Together), 2019 (Second Edition:2021); and
 - (c) *Mangiri Yarda* (Healthy Country: Barngarla Wellbeing and Nature), 2021 (Revivalistics Press).

B7. Lexicographic Apps

28. I have devised a Barngarla Aboriginal Dictionary *App* – see iPhone: https://itunes.apple.com/au/app/barngarla-dictionary/id1151693665?mt=8; Android:

https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=org.regenr8.dictionary.barngarla&hl=en.

B8. International Conferences

- 29. I have been the keynote speaker on the topic of linguistics, phonetics and lexicology at approximately 100 international conferences, including:
 - (a) Sustainable Multilingualism 2021 conference in Kaunas, Lithuania (4-5 June 2021);
 - (b) the International UNICEF Conference on Language Policy in Multicultural and Multilingual Settings, Mandalay, Myanmar (February 2016);
 - (c) Multilingualism Conference of the Centre for International Education, Singapore (May 2015);
 - (d) International UNESCO Conference on Language, Suzhou, China (June 2014);
 - (e) Sixth International Free Linguistics Conference, Sydney (October 2012);
 - (f) 14th China International Conference on Contemporary Linguistics, Xi'an,China (May 2012); and
 - (g) 41st Poznan Linguistics Meeting, Gniezno, Poland (September 2010).

B9. Research Grants

30. I have been awarded more than 20 research grants, inter alia to research and resolve various linguistic, phonetic and lexicological problems. I have been awarded 10 grants from the federal Australian Government, including National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) and Australian Research Council (ARC).

C. INSTRUCTIONS FROM THE BOARD OF DEPUTIES OF BRITISH JEWS

31. On 26 December 2021, Adam Ma'anit from the Board of Deputies of British Jews, contacted me via email and provided me with a link to footage from an

incident that occurred in Oxford Street, London, earlier this month: https://twitter.com/boardofdeputies/status/1467241977188171792?s=21

- 32. I understand that the incident received media coverage, for example by the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC) and the Jewish Chronicle.
- 33. I was instructed by Mr Ma'anit to provide the Board of Deputies of British Jews with an independent expert report on the following four questions:
 - a. What language is being spoken?;
 - b. What is being said?;
 - c. Apply both phrases as asserted 'Dirty Muslims' and 'Tikrah le mishehu ze dahof' (sic) and judge whether one or the other can be definitively ruled out given your understanding of human speech patterns, language, accent, context, syntax, cadence, etc. any other linguistic analysis that would provide definitive evidence one way or the other.
 - d. Can you discern any anti-Muslim slur at any point in the footage, either in English or in Hebrew?
- 34. I then asked Mr Ma'anit to provide me with a verified, uncompressed raw footage of the incident. The reason is that the compressed version in the social media and BBC might well be of inferior quality, resulting in mishearing.
- 35. Mr Ma'anit provided me immediately with the following uncompressed raw footage: https://www.dropbox.com/s/83swgcanzdeyjee/IMG 1674.MOV?dl=0
- 36. I have been told by Mr Ma'anit that this very footage had been independently verified by DigFind and D3 Forensics (see 'REPORT ON DIGITAL FORENSIC ACQUISITION AND ANALYSIS REVIEW') as being the original uncompressed source footage with intact metadata, and had been confirmed to have not been tampered with.
- 37. I also asked Mr Ma'anit where *exactly* within the footage the BBC heard 'Dirty Muslims'. He told me that the BBC had informed the Jewish Chronicle that they heard 'Dirty Muslims' around the 3 second mark within the footage.

38. I also asked Mr Ma'anit when exactly the footage was filmed and he told me that it was filmed at 20:03:52 UTC time (which coincides with GMT time at the moment) on 29 November 2021.

D. ANALYSIS OF THE FOOTAGE

D1. First Question

- 39. I listened to the footage various times and I could hear both native Israeli and nonnative English throughout the footage. However, around the 3 second mark I can only hear native Israeli.
- 40. At this point, I would like to elaborate on what I mean by Israeli. Israeli is the language spoken in Israel today, which is usually referred to as Hebrew or Modern Hebrew. As explained in my 2020 book *Revivalistics: From the Genesis of Israeli to Language Reclamation in Australia and Beyond* (New York: Oxford University Press), Israeli is a Semito-European hybrid language: both Afro-Asiatic (mainly Hebrew) and Indo-European (mainly Yiddish).
- 41. The distinction between Israeli, the language spoken natively in today's Israel today, and Hebrew, the language of the Old Testament, is most relevant to the analysis here. The reason is that the phonetics of Israeli is by and large Yiddish.
- 42. So, for example, whilst ק was pronounced in Hebrew as [q] (voiceless uvular plosive), in Israeli, which is spoken in the footage, it is pronounced [k] (voiceless velar plosive). Juxtapose the lexical item for 'heart' and 'dog' in Modern Standard Arabic: غلب [qalb] and غلب [kalb] respectively.
- 43. Similarly, whereas n was pronounced in Hebrew as $[\hbar]$ (voiceless pharyngeal fricative), in Israeli it is pronounced as $[\chi]$ (voiceless uvular fricative).
- 44. I am using the International Phonetic Alphabet, which is a tool used by phoneticians all over the globe:

 https://www.internationalphoneticassociation.org/content/full-ipa-chart

D2. Second Question

45. The Board of Deputies of British Jews asked me what is being said around the 3 second mark within the footage. I can hear an Israeli sentence, as following:

תקרא למישהו, זה דחוף!

IPA: [tik'sa le'mi[u ze da'xuf]

ti-krá le-míshu ze dakhúf

lit. 'you.will-call (imperative, singular, masculine) to-someone (singular, masculine) this urgent'

i.e. 'Call someone, it's urgent!'

- 46. There is no way other than the male voice to induce from the grammar of this sentence that the *speaker* is a male.
- 47. However, the verb *tikrá* demonstrates that the *person the speaker is talking to* is a single male. Had it been a single female, the speaker would have said תקרא *tikréi* rather than תקרא *tikrá*. Had the speaker spoken to several people at the same time (either male or female), he would have uttered תקרא *tikréu* rather than תקרא *tikréu* rather than תקרא *tikréu*.
- 18. It should be noted that מישהו, in theory *míshehu* (three syllables), is pronounced in the footage natively as *míshu* (two syllables only). In other words, there is an omission of *eh*. Such an omission is very common in fast speech by native Israeli speakers, *inter alia* due to the fact that most Israeli speakers do not pronounce [h] (cf., *mutatis mutandis*, Italian).
- 49. It should also be noted that the person uttering this sentence pronounces the voiceless uvular fricative [χ] as a native Israeli speaker. This sound exists in English in *Loch Ness* and in German in *Aachen* (the toponym). But most native English speakers often mispronounce it, see *chutzpah* and *Hanukhah*.

D3. Third Question

50. The Board of Deputies of British Jews asked me to apply both phrases as asserted 'Dirty Muslims' and 'Tikrah le mishehu ze dahof' (sic) and judge whether

- one or the other can be definitively ruled out given my understanding of human speech patterns, language, accent, context, syntax, cadence, etc.
- 51. Given the above native pronunciations of *mishu* and *dakhúf*, and given the cohesiveness of the complex sentence in Israeli ('Call someone, it's urgent!'), it is clear to me that what is heard around the 3 second mark is a native Israeli sentence rather than an English expression.
- 52. I hypothesize that the BBC editor(s)/reporter(s) misheard *mishu* as *Muslim*, and perhaps even the preceding *tikrá le* as *dirty*.
- 53. The BBC staff's mishearing might have resulted from applying their Apollonian tendency, a concept that I explore in length starting from p. 14 in my book Language Contact and Lexical Enrichment in Israeli Hebrew (Palgrave Macmillan, 2003).
- 54. The Apollonian tendency is the wish to create order, the craving for meaningfulness, especially when encountering unfamiliar information. The problem with the Apollonian tendency in language arises from the fact that a person applying his/her Apollonian tendency only uses what is accessible in his/her brain.
- 55. A Briton visiting Japan might well hear the Japanese expression for 'not at all' (following 'thank you') as *Don't touch your moustache!* instead of どういたしまして dou itashimashite. The Briton would need a lot of chutzpah, however, to jump to a conclusion that the Japanese person talking to him is alleging that he, the Briton, has too much facial hair.

D4. Fourth Question

- 56. Finally, the Board of Deputies of British Jews asked me whether I can discern any anti-Muslim slur in particular, at any point in the footage, either in English or in Hebrew.
- 57. I have listened to the rest of the clip in its entirety and was unable to detect any anti-Muslim slur at any point in the footage: neither in Israeli nor in English.

E. DECLARATION

I have made all the enquiries that I believe are desirable and appropriate. No matters of significance that I regard as relevant have, to my knowledge, been withheld from the Board of Deputies of British Jews.

Affirmed by Ghil'ad Zuckermann at Adelaide, South Australia, Australia, this 27th day of December 2021

Signature